

## Report on 2019 Meeting of The Banting Research Foundation Grant Review Panel

Submitted by Reinhart Reithmeier (Chair) and Patricia Brubaker (Vice-Chair and Scientific Officer)

The 2019 Meeting of The Banting Research Foundation Grant Review Panel took place from 10:00 am to 3:00 pm on Wednesday, May 15th in Room 101 in the Old Administrative Building at the University of Toronto. The Banting Research Foundation Grant Review Panel had the following members (all at U of T unless otherwise indicated): Reinhart Reithmeier (Chair), Patricia Brubaker (Vice-Chair and Scientific Officer), Irene Andrulis, Imogen Coe (Ryerson University), Whitney Berta, Brent Derry, Rodrigo Fernandez-Gonzalez, Anthony Gramolini, Edith Hillan, Lorraine Kalia, Peter Lewis, Robert Maunder, Daniel Moore, Arthur Mortha, Kelly O'Brien, Jon Rocheleau and Christopher Yip. Fernandez-Gonzalez, Gramolini, and Maunder could not attend and their reviews were presented by the Chair. After introductions, the Chair outlined the review and scoring procedure as well as the confidentiality and conflict of interest guidelines. Aubie Angel, Vice-chair of the Board of Trustees, attended briefly and thanked the panel members for their participation in the review process.

The complete list of applications was sent out to all reviewers to determine their level of expertise (High, Medium, Low, Conflict) as well as Conflicts-of-Interest. Grant assignments (Primary Reviewer, Secondary Review and Reader) were made by the Chair and reviewed by the Vice-Chair. All reviewers rated their ~12 applications using the CIHR scale (0-4.9) and the Primary Reviewer and Secondary Review were each asked to rank their applications and fill in a 1-page written report. Applications that were rated in the top 1/3 by both reviewers and all those ranked #1 by one reviewer were discussed at the meeting in order of the preliminary average scores. After presentation of each application by the reviewers and its discussion, the SO summarized the discussion and a consensus score (0-4.9) was assigned to each application after which each reviewer voted privately +/- 0.5 from the consensus score. There was a strong consensus around the quality of most of the applications and any divergence of opinion was resolved at the meeting to come up with a consensus score for each application. The averages of the private scores were tabulated after the meeting by Tavia Caplan to come up with a final score and ranking.

A total of 79 applications were received from across Canada:

- 9 were from BC (4 UBC, 3 Victoria, 1 SFU, 1 Thompson Rivers University)
- 5 from Alberta (1 Mount Royal University, 4 U Alberta)
- 1 from Saskatchewan (U Regina)
- 2 from Manitoba (U Manitoba)
- 39 from Ontario (1 from Carleton U, 1 from Wilfrid Laurier, 1 from Lakehead University, 5 from Queen's, 3 from U Guelph, 2 from McMaster, 1 from U Ottawa, 4 from Ryerson, 1 from Trent, 10 from U Toronto/affiliated hospitals, 6 from Western U, 1 from Windsor, 1 from York, 2 from Colleges[disqualified])
- 12 from Quebec (2 from Concordia, 5 from McGill, 3 from U Montréal, and 2 from Sherbrooke)
- 4 from Nova Scotia (3 from Dalhousie U, 1 Saint Mary's University)
- 4 from New Brunswick (2 from UNB, 1 from Mount Allison University, 1 from Atlantic Cancer Research Centre)
- 3 from Newfoundland (Memorial University)

Of the total of 79 applications, the 22 most highly rated were reviewed at the meeting. Overall, 36 (46%) were from female applicants and 43 (54%) from male applicants. Of those that were reviewed by the panel 12 (55%) were from female applicants and 10 (45%) were from male applicants.

Reinhart Reithmeier

---

Reinhart Reithmeier, PhD  
Chair, Grant Review Panel

Patricia Brubaker

---

Patricia Brubaker, PhD  
Vice Chair and Scientific Officer, Grant Review Panel